Sacred Images and Normativity: Contested Forms in Early Modern Art

SACRIMA SERIES: The Normativity of Sacred Images in Early Modern Europe

This book series aims to foster the publication of original research – in the form of both edited books and monographs – on the topic of image normativity in Renaissance and Early Modern art in a global context.

Chiara Franceschini, Series Editor

In preparation:

***Holy Children and Liminality in Early Modern Art*, Sacrima Series 2**
Chiara Franceschini and Cloe Cavero de Carondelet, Editors

***Madonne. Reframing Images of Mary in Early Modern Spaces*, Sacrima Series 3**
Chiara Franceschini and Erin Giffin, Editors

Sacred Images and Normativity: Contested Forms in Early Modern Art

edited by
Chiara Franceschini

BREPOLS

The Normativity
of Sacred Images
in Early Modern Europe

This publication has received funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's research and innovation programme Horizon 2020, grant agreement n° 680192/SACRIMA and from the Adele Hartmann Program of the Ludwig Maximilian University (LMU), Munich.

© 2021, Brepols Publishers n.v., Turnhout, Belgium.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

ISBN 978-2-503-58466-9
E-ISBN 978-2-503-59346-3
DOI 10.1484/M.SACRIMA-EB.5.122577
ISSN 2736-4208

Design: Lupo Burtscher, Bozen

Printed in the EU on acid-free paper.

D/2021/0095/396

Table of Contents

Table of Contents

Foreword p. 10

INTRODUCTION Images as Norms in Europe and Beyond: A Research Program p. 12
Chiara Franceschini

I. Images and Trials

CHAPTER 1 *Fumi-e*: Trampled Sacred Images in Japan p. 30
Yoshie Kojima

CHAPTER 2 Too Many Wounds: Innocenzo da Petralia's Excessive Crucifixes and the Normative Image p. 46
Chiara Franceschini

CHAPTER 3 Wounds on Trial: Forensic Truth, Sanctity, and the Early Modern Visual Culture of Ritual Murder p. 68
Cloe Cavero de Carondelet

CHAPTER 4 The Image and Cult of *Sette Arcangeli* facing Roman Censorship p. 86
Escardiel González Estévez

II. Contested Portraits

CHAPTER 5 The Return of Andrea Casali: Legal Evidence, Imposture, and the Portrait in Late Renaissance Italy p. 104
Mattia Biffis

CHAPTER 6 Simulating and Appropriating the Sacred: The Background to a Papal Ban on Saintly Portraits of Non-Saints p. 118
James Hall

CHAPTER 7 *Ritratti rubati*: Portraits of Post-Tridentine Saints as *pia fraus* p. 136
Nina Niedermeier

CHAPTER 8 Ignatius of Loyola as a Normative Image p. 154
Steffen Zierholz

III. The Norm and the Copy

CHAPTER 9 — In between Sacred Space and Collection: An Altarpiece from Augsburg and the Norms of Catholic Art around 1600 — *Antonia Putzger* — p. 172

CHAPTER 10 — The Tradition of Change in Copies of the Santa Casa di Loreto: The Case of San Clemente in Venice — *Erin Giffin* — p. 188

CHAPTER 11 — Sebastiano del Piombo: The Normative Sacred Image between Italy and Spain — *Piers Baker-Bates* — p. 204

IV. Pictorial and Material Depths

CHAPTER 12 — The Reception of Divine Grace in Hendrick ter Brugghen's *Crucifixion with the Virgin and Saint John* — *Josephine Neil* — p. 224

CHAPTER 13 — Alonso Cano's *The Miracle of the Well*: Material Forms, Temporalities, and the Invention of Miraculous Marian Images — *Livia Stoenescu* — p. 242

CHAPTER 14 — Middle Natures, Human Stone: Fossils, Ribera, and Fanzago at Certosa di San Martino, Naples — *Todd P. Olson* — p. 260

Contributors p. 280
Bibliography p. 283
Indexes p. 310
Photo Credits p. 318

Foreword

This new book series stems from the research project SACRIMA: *The Normativity of Sacred Images in Early Modern Europe*, developed at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich and funded by the European Research Council (ERC). It aims to foster the publication of original research — in the form of both edited books and monographs — on the topic of image normativity in Renaissance and early modern art in a global context. This first volume, *Sacred Images and Normativity: Contested Forms in Early Modern Art*, includes a selection of contributions from the first Sacrima conference organized by the project in Munich in 2017, and from the following 2018 seminar series *Forms and Norms in European Art and Beyond*. The scope of these endeavours was to open a dialogue among scholars of different provenances, specializations, and backgrounds on the notion of 'visual normativity'. For this first book, we focused on 'contested forms'. Early modern objects, images, and artworks were often nodes of discussion and contestation, expressed in different forms, languages, and contexts. However, if images were regularly contested by competing agencies (such as writers, religious and secular authorities, image theoreticians, various inquisitions etc.), artists and objects were just as likely to impose their own rules and standards through the reiteration or challenging of established visual traditions, styles, iconographies, materialities, reproductions, and reframings. Reversing the paradigms of studies on censorship and iconoclasm, which tend to focus on the passivity of images against external attacks, this volume and series aim to shed light on the active role and capacity of the image as agent — either in actual legal processes or, more generally, in the creation of new visual standards and social behaviours. At present, there is no study that comprehensively discusses the many diverse instances of the multi-layered normative power of images, objects, and art. This collection certainly does not fill this desideratum exhaustively. However, it aims to start a new exploration by means of fourteen case studies, which focus in different ways and from different perspectives on the intersections between the limits of the sacred image and the power of art in early modern Europe and beyond.

This volume has benefited greatly from the collaboration of all members of the Sacrima research team in Munich. In particular, Cloe Cavero de Carondelet and Erin Giffin have contributed with precision and attention to the editing and proofreading of the volume and especially of, respectively, the essays regarding Spanish topics and the English language standards throughout the book. Nelleke de Vries took care of revising the captions and indexes. Miriam Kreischer and Christina Vetter helped with image acquisition and copyrights. I would like to thank all the authors for having accepted to contribute to this project with enthusiasm and competence. The support and advice of colleagues at the LMU, the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte in Munich, and the Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florence have also been crucial for the success of this project at its different stages. The design studio Lupo Burtscher in Bozen has accompanied the manifestations of the Sacrima Project since its beginnings. Finally, warmest thanks go to Johan Van der Beke and his team at Brepols for having accepted the idea of this new series and for his continuous support and advice.

Chiara Franceschini